

TRIBUTES TO
DAVID FREEDBERG

TRIBUTES TO

David Freedberg

Image and Insight

EDITED BY
CLAUDIA SWAN



HARVEY MILLER PUBLISHERS

HARVEY MILLER PUBLISHERS
An Imprint of Brepols Publishers
London / Turnhout

Publication is made possible in part by a gift from Elizabeth Warnock
to the Department of Art History at Northwestern University.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book
is available from the British Library
ISBN 978-1-909400-70-2
D/2019/0095/146



© 2019, Brepols Publishers n.v., Turnhout, Belgium

All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by
any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or
otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher

© BREPOLS PUBLISHERS

THIS DOCUMENT MAY BE PRINTED FOR PRIVATE USE ONLY.
IT MAY NOT BE DISTRIBUTED WITHOUT PERMISSION OF THE PUBLISHER.

Contents

Acknowledgments	1
Introduction	
Claudia Swan	3
 <i>The North</i>	
<i>Florilegium: The Origins of the Flower Still Life in the Early Modern Netherlands</i>	
Marisa Anne Bass	11
 Poussin's Idolatrous Dances	
Emily A. Beeny	27
 Rembrandt's So-Called 'Faust' as Self-Portrait of the Artist-Kabbalist in the Studio	
Benjamin Binstock	45
 Rubens and the Gallery of Beauties	
Adam Eaker	61
 Rubens and the Twelve Years' Truce: Reconsidering the <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> for the Antwerp Town Hall	
Robert Fucci	75
 Kitchen Scenes and Performance at the Antwerp Dinner Party	
Claudia Goldstein	89
 Something's Missing: A Note on the Historiography of Rubens's <i>Rockox Triptych</i>	
Koenraad Jonckheere	101
 The Lemon's Lure	
Mariët Westermann	115
 Forging Rubens: Antwerp and the Vaenius Studio	
Anne T. Woollett	131

Print Matters

Capitals between Rome and Nuremberg: Creating and Transferring Style c. 1470-75 Renzo Baldasso	149
‘Imitation and its Discontents’: Hercules Segers’s Window Catherine Levesque	165
Vorsterman, Van Dyck, and Rubens’s Printmaking Enterprise Victoria Sancho Lobis	175
What Price Innovation? The Cost of Printing the Paris Polyglot Bible Peter N. Miller	187
Hans van Luyck and the Byways of Flemish Landscape Prints Alexandra Onuf	203
Rembrandt’s <i>Christ Presented to the People</i> (1655): A Report on the Crowd Peter Parshall	219
‘Various Rare Paintings and Printed Artworks for Art Lovers’: Jan Pietersz Berendrecht and the Origins of the Dutch Painter-Etcher Tradition Elizabeth Wyckoff	233

The Powers of Images

Venus, Slashed: Objectification and Artistic Agency Carolyn Behrmann	251
The <i>Bios</i> of the Image: Living Thanks to Fiction Chiara Cappelletto	261
Image, sensation, disproportion Georges Didi-Huberman	269
Stoning the Doge: Popular Aggression and Political ‘Iconoclasm’ in Early Modern Venice Maartje van Gelder	279

The Anthropomorphic Drive: Similitude, Simulation, Empathy Andrea Pinotti	291
Emotions in Art from Giambattista della Porta to David Freedberg Gary Schwartz	301
Images of Power: Dinglinger's Dresden Miniatures Larry Silver	313
Inhabited Sculptures, Lethal Weapons Carolyn Yerkes	327
 <i>Italian Subjects</i>	
Angles and Demons: Considerations on the Aesthetics of Ground Plan Drawings in the Renaissance Francesco Benelli	343
The Black Page: The Ottoman Connection David Bindman	359
Le Cacce dei Papi Giovanna Alberta Campitelli	367
Guido Reni, Antonio Bruni, and a Poetics of Response Jonathan Unglaub	381
Drawings from the Gennari Inventory of 1719 Veronica Maria White	401
 <i>The Artist</i>	
The Minotaur in the Drawings of Peter Vos: An <i>Alter Ego</i> ? Jan Piet Filedt Kok	417
'Divine' or Not? Poetic Responses to the Art of Michelangelo Diletta Gamberini	431
William Kentridge: Renaissance Man of Johannesburg Margaret K. Koerner	443

Theory; Connoisseurship

Erwin Panofskys Habilitation und die Rhythmik des Films Horst Bredekamp	455
<i>Mise en abyme: A Reframing</i> Carlo Ginzburg	465
Connoisseurship Revisited: The Case of <i>Saul and David</i> Emilie E.S. Gordenker	481
'Rubens Only Whispers': The Reception of the Cambridge <i>Bozzetti</i> for the <i>Triumph of the Eucharist</i> Tapestry Series Meredith M. Hale	491
The Style and Substance of Ancient Coins: Louis Savot, Numismatics, and Connoisseurship in the Age of the Paper Museum William Stenhouse	505
List of Publications by David Freedberg	515



Introduction

CLAUDIA SWAN

Image & Insight

Recently, a student asked me how I became an art historian. No single event that catapulted me into the profession came to mind, but I recalled without hesitation the person who made the study of art history compelling and consequential. David Freedberg joined the faculty at Columbia University when I was an undergraduate; it was in his classes on northern European art and under his supervision as my senior thesis advisor that I came to know his work. What remains impressive and is widely recognized is his abiding commitment both to pictures—images of all sorts; their making and undoing; their impact and our responses to them—and to ideas about them. David Freedberg's work turns on an axis of image and insight.

In my oldest memory of him he is teaching before a giant screen in Schermerhorn Hall; one of Pieter Bruegel the Elder's extraordinary pen and ink landscape drawings is projected on it (Fig. 1). His colleague and beloved friend David Rosand had mentioned that I should seek out Professor Freedberg, as 'you and he might have something to say to one another'. A decade later, that academic conversation would culminate in my dissertation, which he advised. Now, on behalf of the authors who have generously contributed their work, I offer this volume in gratitude for the scholarly and personal exchange—which goes way back and extends in all directions, not unlike that Bruegel landscape.

When I first met him, David had published exclusively in the field of early modern northern art—what he refers to as 'his traditional areas'—and established himself as a scholar whose ambitious historical range was matched by his erudition, sound judgment, and quick wit. His lithe survey of *Dutch Landscape Prints of the Seventeenth Century* (1980) is an indispensable account of printed landscapes coeval with the Dutch Republic. His *Corpus Rubenianum* volume on depictions of *The Life of Christ after the Passion* (1984) by Peter Paul Rubens secured him a place among scholars of Flemish art further consolidated by publications on art in Antwerp after the iconoclastic outbreaks of the 1560s, up to and including the marvelous oil sketches by the Flemish master. Dedication to the study of the making of images, pictorial conventions, and artistic reputation has always gone hand in hand with a commitment to understanding how and why we humans respond to pictures. His Oxford University PhD thesis, 'Iconoclasm and Painting in the Revolt of the Netherlands, 1566–1609', is the seed from which the mighty study *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (1989) sprang.

The Power of Images is now thirty years old, and it is no exaggeration to claim that it has had an impact around the globe and across the humanities—even into the sciences. The opening lines are canonical: 'This book is not about the history of art. It is about the relations between images and people in history'.¹ Since its publication,

¹ David Freedberg, *The Power of Images. Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (Chicago/London: University of Chicago

Press, 1989), p. xix.

new forms of art history have grown up around the book. Commitment to all sorts of images, not just works of art, is a hallmark of recent art history; reliance on the ways and means of disciplines such as anthropology, philosophy, and sociology is no longer unusual or questionable. *The Power of Images* considers wax effigies and pilgrim tokens; miracle-working images; sexually arousing images; ex-votos and other forms of efficacious images; paintings of the adoration of idols; and much else. The visual materials that populate the account of the long history of response range from amulets, ampullae, and clay figurines to paintings by European old masters of *The Adoration of the Golden Calf*, and many others as well. A cornucopia of visual evidence is matched by scrupulous study of textual, ethnographic, and historical claims for the potential of visual representation. Throughout, the sense of purpose in David's writing elicits the reader's participation in what still reads like an ongoing conversation.

In the same year that *The Power of Images* appeared, so did the exhibition catalogue and essays on *The Prints of Pieter Bruegel the Elder*. One would not readily have surmised from one that the other was in production, but this is an abiding quality of David's work: it oscillates between wide-ranging, theoretically informed analyses of phenomena related to the effects of pictures and agile readings of individual images or works of art. Ultimately, his commitment to a conception of the power of images and to the artistic, social, and political impact of iconoclasm informs both publications: his account of Pieter Bruegel's life and works explores how artistic strategies and personal beliefs overlapped, and suggests that the ability to elicit a variety of responses on the part of beholders is key to the 'genius of Bruegel'.² His interest in art theory and in the history of response has never prevented David from acknowledging

artistic qualities or the power of artists themselves. In the years following the publication of *The Power of Images*, he published essays on the conceptual works of the contemporary artist Joseph Kosuth and on the oil sketches of Peter Paul Rubens, demonstrating a sustained interest in how artists make their respective marks.

Among David's most startling discoveries are thousands of natural history drawings commissioned by the seventeenth-century virtuoso Federico Cesi, founder of the Accademia dei Lincei in Rome. He stumbled across these watercolours first in Windsor Castle and, later, elsewhere, and compiled and published them in a series of dedicated volumes. In *The Eye of the Lynx. Galileo, His Friends, and the Beginnings of Modern Natural History* (2003) and volumes published by Harvey Miller on aspects of the 'paper museum' assembled by the Roman antiquarian Cassiano dal Pozzo, he situates these extraordinary drawings within the making of early modern Italian natural history among Galileo's friends and colleagues. Never one to pass up an opportunity to think big when it comes to pictures, David offers in *The Eye of the Lynx* a stunning account of the Linceans, their campaigns to reproduce the world in visual form, and the ways in which simultaneous efforts to tabulate and classify knowledge rendered pictures problematic. His research was inspired, he writes, by a dream, and it led him to consider, with specific reference to early modern Rome, the fundamental question of how we can know the truths of nature. Accounting for the realization among the Linceans 'that what lynxes saw with their keen eyes was not always to be trusted,' David concludes by considering, as he does throughout his work, our need for images, and proposes that a world without pictures would be 'a dead and dry world free of the incessant chaos of life'.³

² David Freedberg, 'Allusion and Topicality in the Work of Pieter Bruegel: The Implications of a Forgotten Polemic,' in David Freedberg, *The Prints of Pieter Bruegel the Elder* (Tokyo: The Tokyo Shimbun, 1989), pp. 53–65 (p. 64).

³ David Freedberg, *The Eye of the Lynx: Galileo, His Friends, and the Beginnings of Modern Natural History* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003), p. 416.

David is an incomparable art historian and humanist, whose research extends well beyond the works mentioned here. (See List of Publications by David Freedberg, pp. 515-523) He has engaged extensively with the work of Aby Warburg, and continues to write about the cultural history of the architecture and dance of the Pueblo peoples. In his recent forays into cognitive neuroscience and collaborations with neuroscientists he explores the physiological dimensions of the cultural history told in *The Power of Images*, by experiment on the relations between vision, embodiment, movement, and emotion. Some of this recent work featured in his 2016–17 Cambridge University Slade lectures on ‘Art, History and Neuroscience: The Work of Art in the Age of Digital Reproducibility’, which promise a forthcoming book on the subject.

In among the major works cited here in passing, numerous other articles and essays are less canonical but no less significant. ‘Science, Commerce, and Art: Neglected Topics at the Junction of History and Art History’ (1991) is unsurpassed in mapping connections between natural historical observation, collecting, enterprise and expeditions, and art in the long Golden Age of Dutch art; the brisk essay ‘Imitation and its Discontents’ (1992) is a tour de force on the matter of mimesis. We all have our favorites, to be sure. In his written work and in person David engages deeply with his audience, involving us and encouraging our response. One of the chief characteristics of his manner is how he invokes us, readers, students, colleagues: ‘once we grasp...’, he writes, and ‘we see’, ‘we still need to know’, ‘we understand’. We are called truly to consider, illuminated by his erudition and historical compass, what pictures are and can be, and how they operate.

Learning from Landscapes

David Freedberg taught me first to look at landscapes. The English word ‘landscape’ designates ‘a picture representing natural inland scenery’; it dates to the early years of the seventeenth century and derives from the Dutch ‘*landschap*’, which refers to a circumscribed piece of land or territory or province.⁴ His first book, *Dutch Landscape Prints of the Seventeenth Century*, charts the emergence of images that capture the Dutch usage, and relates the abundance of landscape etchings, engravings, and woodcuts created in the northern Netherlands to the recognition in 1609 of the independence of the United Provinces of the Netherlands from Spain. In a characteristically erudite essay brimming with insight, he presents constellations of artists who offered one another mutual inspiration; describes the artistic effects of a variety of techniques; and investigates literary and theoretical terms by which we can better understand the emergence of ‘a specifically Dutch preoccupation with landscape.’⁵ Above all the book shows how the prosaic, the quotidian, the local came to occupy central stage in a form of art that was widely disseminated and appreciated as typical of the emergent nation state; it explores how momentous political events informed a turn to local places and an emergent aesthetic.

One of the earliest uses of the English term cited in the *OED* gets to the heart of what landscape can be and was to the Dutch artists who populate that book: ‘As in a curious Lant-schape, oft we see Nature, so follow’d, as wee thinke it’s shee.’⁶ In landscape an artist imitates nature, occasionally to the point of creating a new nature; those invented terrains may amount to new lands. David’s *Dutch Landscape Prints*, clear and vivid in its exposition, allows for all manner of variety and difference,

⁴ ‘landscape, n.’ *Oxford English Dictionary*, 2nd ed. (1989), s.v. ‘landscape.’ *Landschap*, znw. onz. ook vr., mv. -pen. Mnl. *lantscap*; os. *landskepi*, mnd. *lantschap*; ohd. *landskaf*, mhd. *lantschaft*, nhd. *landschaft*; ags. *landscipe*. Van Land. *Woordenboek der Nederlandsche Taal*, ed. by Fons Moerdijk et al. Online. November 2018.

⁵ David Freedberg, *Dutch Landscape Prints of the Seventeenth Century* (London: British Museum, 1980), p. 9.

⁶ ‘1610 A. Gibson in J. Guillim Display of Heraldrie sig. (a)3v’ *Oxford English Dictionary*, s.v. ‘landscape.’

avoiding a single interpretive pathway. Dutch landscape prints are like and unlike landscape paintings; they bear comparison to poetry that evinces pleasure in the local surroundings but are distinct in their formulations; they are variously pastoral, innovative, devout, topographically accurate, scientifically inclined. Hercules Segers's landscape prints, recognized in their time as 'printed paintings,' are singularly innovative and imaginative; and rather than excusing them as exceptional, Freedberg makes them central to his account. Visions of a local terrain amounted to artistic triumphs and acquired new political status, all while serving their viewers' pleasure: the concept of the picture ('landscape') and of the terrain (*landschap*) are closely related. In his first book, as throughout his work, David presents, describes, and conceptualizes whole new terrains—vast landscapes in themselves.

The mighty Alpine panorama that I recall David teaching (Fig. 1) is a signal example of landscapes by the forefather of the works surveyed in *Dutch Landscape Prints*, which contains this passage about Bruegel's painted, drawn, and printed landscapes:

The eye ranges over a multiplicity of detail spread out in such vast and breathtaking vistas that these landscapes have often been called cosmic and universal. They are both probable and improbable landscapes: probable, because individual features within them are topographically accurate and clearly based on drawings from nature; improbable, because the scenes as a whole are deliberately composed, imaginative visions. As a whole they have little foundation in reality, for all the realistic detail.⁷

We depend on David for his exceptional ability to combine a bird's-eye perspective with more local views—maneuvering between particular works, a Bruegel drawing, for example, or an etching by

Rembrandt, and matters larger in scope, such as natural history and the arts or the powers and dangers of images.

David himself is a man of many landscapes. They range from rural South Africa, where he was raised; to London, where he began his career and to which he returned recently as Director of the Warburg Institute; and to Italy, New York, the American Southwest, and the northernmost coast of Maine. There are more, of course: institutional landscapes include the Italian Academy at Columbia University, of which he is director, and the many institutes of advanced study where he has spent time and on whose boards he serves. These topographical landscapes are compounded by the awesome geography of his publications and the astonishing range of images, texts, ideas, concepts, and socio-historical events they touch on. Many of these sites and concerns are in play in this volume of tributes.

The authors who have contributed to this volume do so in friendship and dedication to David: some have studied with him, others have been immediate colleagues, and still others know him as a fellow art historian. His work on the many subjects he commands has inspired a wide range of essays. Like the most gratifying landscapes, his work offers a virtually inexhaustible source of commentary and inspiration. This volume brings together essays written by scholars who met David in London at the Warburg Institute long ago and over dinner; in seminar rooms and in the Department of Art History and Archaeology at Columbia University; in museum galleries and print rooms and libraries; at the Italian Academy and other research institutes; and by other means and in other places too. Given in friendship and in admiration, they are all also presented in the spirit of conversation that David inspires. They are divided according to rough categories that adhere to various areas of his scholarship and his teaching, and are united in a deep respect for his

⁷ Freedberg, *Dutch Landscape Prints*, p. 21.

erudition and vibrant commitment to the pursuit of knowledge. Together, they honour the poles of David's work: image and insight.

The specific landscape David has now come to prefer above others is the final stretch of northern coastal Maine, on the Bay of Fundy. The remoteness of the setting is remarkable. Although one imagines his turning to georgic pursuits there, he has engaged with the landscape in other ways too—its historic preservation. He has led the campaign to save Liberty Hall in Machiasport, Maine, a historical building overlooking the site of the first sea battle of the American Revolution. That landscape is a place another denizen of the northern regions of North America, the poet Elizabeth Bishop, wrote about. Returning in her

poem 'At the Fishhouses' (1955) to where she grew up, in Nova Scotia, Bishop describes the waters as 'cold dark deep and absolutely clear'. In the final lines of the poem she shifts her focus from prosaic encounter to the formation of an indelible image, describing what I most associate with David and his landscapes, on and off paper. Of the cold dark deep water, Bishop writes:

It is like what we imagine knowledge to be:
dark, salt, clear, moving, utterly free,
drawn from the cold hard mouth
of the world, derived from the rocky breasts
forever, flowing and drawn, and since
our knowledge is historical, flowing and flown.



Fig. 1. Pieter Bruegel the Elder, *Landscape Composition with a River*; 1553. Pen and brown ink on paper, 22.9 × 33.8 cm. British Museum, London, inv. no. Oo, 9.9.

